Lessons Learned

Engaging Civil Society in REDD+ Programme (2009 – 2010)

Prepared for WWF Forest Carbon Initiative
by Gabrielle Kissinger, Lexeme Consulting

July 2010

WWF Engaging Civil Society in REDD+ Programme (2009 – 2010)

Lessons Learned

Prepared for WWF Forest Carbon Initiative
by: Gabrielle Kissinger, Lexeme Consulting
July 2010

About this Paper

This paper was commissioned by WWF's Forest Carbon Initiative and authored by Gabrielle Kissinger of Lexeme Consulting. It is intended to support the sharing of lessons learned from WWF's *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+ Programme.*

The information and opinions expressed in this paper are solely the responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of WWF.

Acknowledgements

Norad

WWF gratefully acknowledges the support of the Government of Norway through a grant administered by the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (Norad). The views expressed herein are not intended to reflect the policy views of either of these entities or their affiliates.

For further information

WWF welcomes comments on this paper. Please contact: forestcarbon@wwf.panda.org

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

Reducing carbon emissions from deforestation and forest degradation, conservation, sustainable management of forests and enhancement of forest carbon stocks in developing countries (REDD+) is anticipated to be part of a post-Kyoto climate change treaty. In the lead-up to the December 2009 UNFCCC Conference of the Parties meeting in Copenhagen (COP 15) a consensus was emerging around the critical role that forests play in stabilizing our earth's atmosphere, and that a new REDD+ mechanism could stem forest carbon emissions while also improving the lives of forest communities.

Guided by WWF's overall forests and climate vision of no net greenhouse gas emissions from deforestation and forest degradation by 2020, WWF's Forest Carbon Initiative (FCI) developed the *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+ (2009-2010)* proposal for the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (Norad). The *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+* proposal sought to build capacity and contribute to the readiness of national REDD+ programmes in several key forest countries – particularly in several countries with high rates of deforestation and forest degradation, and in countries or regions, such as the Congo Basin and Guyana, whose large and highly biodiverse forest estates are not currently threatened but will be increasingly vulnerable to deforestation pressure. The proposal sought to develop tools and analysis produced by WWF's cross-cutting global programmes in science, forests and economic policy in order to develop and sharpen the policy frameworks and scientific underpinnings for effective REDD+ delivery. And finally, recognizing the need for a strong international agreement on REDD+, WWF identified the need to work with governments, international processes, such as the United Nations Forest Forum (UNFF) and the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD), and organizations to support zero net deforestation and to build a unified lobbying effort for the inclusion of a robust REDD+ mechanism under the UNFCCC.

In July 2009, WWF received funding from the government of Norway, and the initiative *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+* commenced immediately.

This report synthesizes achievements, challenges, and lessons learned across varied geographies and themes over the course of *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+*. The purpose of this report is to share reflections, insights and experiences gained through this work so that others can benefit, and to shape and sharpen future WWF efforts in this complex and rapidly evolving area.

2. Methodology

To document lessons learned through *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+,* the author completed a full review of relevant proposals and background documents, and interviewed all project leads, programme managers and coordinators (refer to Table 1 of the Appendix). The interview questions included: What were the biggest challenges faced? What worked well and what didn't? What was the greatest success? Were project risks identified and mitigated? What assumptions proved correct or incorrect? What lessons learned have greatest applicability to other regions and themes?

3a. Achievements

While achievements, challenges and lessons learned will be discussed in greater detail in the remainder of this report, this section summarizes key achievements of the *Engaging Civil Society and REDD+* Programme:

- The International Forest Policy project leveraged international and 67 national-level commitments to zero net deforestation by 2020 to support global REDD+ policy development and integration between international agencies.
- The Communications Project successfully released the 2009 Forest Carbon Investor Survey and held a media event and panel discussion at the UNFCCC climate talks in Bangkok, in September 2009, resulting in significant media coverage on the enabling conditions for investor confidence in REDD+.
- The REDD+ in Indonesia Project directly influenced the position of the Indonesian President in REDD+ resulting in his pledge that Indonesia would reduce its domestic emissions 26% by 2020, compared to business as usual.
- The REDD+ Science in Peru project demonstrated a cost-effective, high-resolution forest carbon map, which set a new a benchmark for future carbon stock assessments globally, as well as provided a basis for effective monitoring, reporting and verification (MRV) systems.
- REDD+ in Guyana effectively engaged indigenous communities and delivered information to aid in decision-making and REDD+ benefit-sharing options.
- The Deforestation Drivers Project demonstrated a prototype open-source, collaborative mapping system (called Geowiki) to enable civil society and indigenous peoples' assessment of deforestation drivers and planning options under REDD+.

3b. Themes and cross-cutting lessons learned

This section highlights some cross-cutting lessons learned across the project, that complement lessons learned at the project level. Before addressing the lessons learned, the following important contextual observations are offered:

- The grant requirements from the Norwegian government provided an initial 6 month timeline, which was later extended to a year. This hindered development of a fully integrated programme, which hampered efforts to hold an effective project inception and placed significant stress on field teams.
- During the interviews, it became apparent that the staff are very talented, creative, and effective. The geographical and thematic reach of the staff and projects is impressive by any measure, and there exists a natural intrinsic ability by all staff to link their projects to policy and scientific frameworks beyond the focus areas in which they work. Much of the work completed over the 6-7 month period builds a robust platform for the next phase of forest carbon work which will take place under the *REDD+ for People and Nature (2010-2013)* programme over 36 months.

Below are comments and observations in key thematic areas: adaptive management in the complex and rapidly evolving world of REDD+, scaling between levels of REDD+ (local, sub-regional, national, international), deploying science-based tools for measuring, reporting and verification, combating drivers of deforestation, and communications.

Adaptive management in the complex and rapidly evolving world of REDD+

The emerging world of REDD+ is dynamic and complex, and adaptive management is critical for efficiency and delivery of high-value results. Below are specific examples in the areas of information, knowledge and adaptive management; capacity; and the role of the FCI:

Information, knowledge and adaptive management

- *Capitalizing on quick assessment of where opportunities could be maximized* – Some projects have used the ever-changing world of REDD+ to adapt, shift priorities, and seize opportunities. *For example*: The International Finance project focused its efforts on a thorough review of REDD+–related developments in key countries after the publication of the Informal Working Group on Interim Financing for REDD+ (IWG-IFR) report. In the absence of a final COP 15 treaty, these reports proved to be of great value and provided roadmaps for the maturation of REDD+ activities to be pursued over the coming years within these key countries.
- *The coordination of information is critical* – There was inconsistency in the level of literature review and ground-truthing that project leads incorporated into iterative management and maturation of projects. There were numerous reasons for this inconsistency, including leads feeling overwhelmed in their work and not having the time to do a gap analysis before determining project outcomes, to simply not knowing who doing similar work might provide guidance. *For example*: One project sought to hire a consultant to complete work very similar to work already published by the same consulting firm and publicly available on the internet. In another, a government ministry produced a report on the same topic (but at a different scale) within weeks of the publication date of the WWF

report, without anyone's knowledge of it. *Response*: WWF has placed much greater emphasis on coordinating staff working on forest carbon into thematic and geographic teams for information sharing, strategy development and coordination between programme areas.

Capacity

- *The lack of capacity occurs in three areas* – These areas are (1) losing capacity once staff have been trained, (2) losing capacity to more lucrative sectors, and (3) not fully engaging the capacity within WWF. *For example*: Finding skilled capacity at the regional and local level can be a challenge in many countries, and a few leads emphasized the problem of training up staff who then leave to take better-paying jobs. In the Congo Basin, there is a dearth of capacity even within WWF networks, so there is a need to help build civil society. Also noted is that forest carbon scientists are a hot commodity internationally, and WWF is competing with investment banks and carbon trading firms for talent, yet cannot compete at the salary level. *Response*: WWF is developing capacity building plans for each region, advocating that capacity-building be of direct priority within its partnerships and consortiums, and is a creating a support unit to deliver technical skills to pilots and geographic locales, with the intent of training up and promoting local skills and capacity.

The role of the Forest Carbon Initiative

- *Delivering the information, and tools to help collectively navigate through the complex world of REDD+* – Leads consistently identified this as a priority and as a strategic asset for the FCI to advance WWF's delivery on REDD+. Many expressed a desire for more mindful coordination of strategic discussions, as well as for help linking internally for strategy and content dissemination. *For example:* Such help could include the e-mail updates; strategic discussions; and FCI REDD+ Reviews on the machinations of international negotiations, specific aspects of REDD+ architecture and design, financing options, and technical methods for measuring and monitoring forest carbon. *Response*: WWF has since established a lessons learning system, a management team, a new intranet site for information sharing, and plans an inception workshop for each geographic area and across the Network to kick-start the *REDD+ for People and Nature* programme.
- *Offering more support and service to leads and team members* – Many leads expressed a strong desire to tap into more expertise from within the network, and to more directly access FCI processes, such as planning and strategic discussions, a menu of materials and support services to draw from, and facilitation of south-south sharing networks. *Response*: In addition to the learning system, management team, intranet site, and workshops mentioned in the previous point above, WWF is also deepening its linkage between communications and the projects to enable accessing of materials and support.

Scaling between levels of REDD+ (local, sub-regional, national, regional and global)

The WWF has effectively engaged at all levels of REDD+. The challenge now is to knit together the scales so that local and sub-regional pilots inform national policies and international policy frameworks, and vice versa with more demonstration activities at the policy and financial instrument level, in order to test approaches and identify methods for drilling that down to regional and local efforts. Similarly, without an international REDD+ agreement, WWF needs to continue to identify how to best advance work at various scales in order to prepare for eventual roll-up into a global framework with high standards.

- *The most effective linkages between different levels of REDD+ occurred when making such links was identified as a key objective or function of the project*. *For example*: WWF Indonesia effectively utilized their leverage with national-level government decision-makers to influence Indonesia's negotiation stance before and at COP 15, thereby influencing the international level debate on REDD+. Similarly, WWF-Indonesia is strategically viewing federal-level commitments as a means of pressing for changes at regional and district levels – a catch-all approach that relies on lower-level politicians and bureaucrats aligning with the President and ruling party, rather than on attempting to change government institutions from the ground up.
- *How can WWF harness the potential to influence national-level REDD+ development?* – There is clearly a need to assess in greater detail how WWF, with its international scope, leverage, access and capability for constructive engagement, can influence decisions at this scale. *For example*: The Peruvian government has fallen behind on its commitments to REDD+ and has slowed national-level REDD+ development. Perhaps WWF could host an international summit with environment ministers from key countries, and use the forum as a means of sharing between governments, allowing for comparisons and highlighting successes and failures, and thereby increasing competition among countries. WWF could also strengthen its leverage with key countries by cultivating roles with international bodies, such as the Forest Carbon Partnership Facility, so that WWF's influence would extend beyond its programmes and focal regions.
- *Should WWF focus on finance as the key instrument to knit together the scales?* – Given WWF's building expertise and contributions (such as the International Financing project and the Forest Carbon Investor Survey) to this area, and given the need to address the phasing and scaling of a REDD+ financial instrument in the absence of an international agreement, WWF could further clarify how to achieve robust financial mechanisms, determine suitable timing, levels of risk, and create equitable distribution mechanisms.

Deploying science-based tools for measuring, reporting and verification

- *Disseminating lessons learned from the Carnegie-WWF project mapping forest carbon for high-resolution measuring and monitoring, so that other countries can replicate the approach* – This project set a benchmark for future carbon stock assessments globally,

demonstrating a very cost-effective and high-resolution solution supporting REDD+ readiness and country development of MRV systems.[1] The amount of time and effort required at the outset of such a project in order to build the necessary relationships and define responsibilities should not be underestimated. Proposed steps to guide future MRV partnerships are:

1. Sign a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between all partners in an MRV consortium *before* starting action. This should include roles, responsibilities, deliverables, work plan, data rights and attribution conditions, capacity building plan and conflict resolution mechanisms, and ways in which partners are recognised in public statements.
2. Clarify rights and responsibilities for the ownership, attribution and dissemination of data and analysis within the MOU.
3. Prepare a local capacity building plan for inclusion with the MOU that sets out a pathway for ensuring that capacity is in place to collect, analyse and disseminate data and to monitor change over time. This should identify the resources necessary to implement the plan and to replicate the methodology within government and/or civil society.
4. Consider the complexity of arranging planes for LiDAR over flights (e.g. plane hire, fuel supply, permitting, insurance, weather, repair etc).
5. Ensure that donors are coordinated with the aims of the MRV consortium and related projects and are aware of MOUs and long term capacity plans.

- *Strategies to overlay forest carbon values with biodiversity values* – This is of particular importance to WWF, given the need to stream funding to forests with the greatest biodiversity values, greatest carbon values, and those at greatest risk. WWF has both capacity and expertise in this area. *For example*: the High Conservation Value Forest (HCVF) assessment in the International Forest Programme Tool project.

Combating drivers of deforestation and effectively engaging civil society

- *Sharing the power of the Geowiki far and wide* – The development of the Geowiki (a tool developed to monitor and evaluate deforestation drivers and evaluate the value of forest emissions reduction compared to other competing uses) is a perfect example of how *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+* funding contributed to the development of a vital tool to help countries prepare for REDD+. The deployment of the Geowiki, the associated training and ultimately the ability to harness information for decision-making, are together powerful components for *REDD+ for People and Nature*.
- *Building local and regional support, involving stakeholders, and building local and regional capacity and training to promote REDD+ is complex and requires more focus* – Some leads commented that such activities can be as complex as that of carbon measurements and monitoring, though this complexity seems under-appreciated. There is a greater need to harness WWF direction and support on REDD+ governance issues (for

[1] For technical information, refer to: http://geoservidor.minam.gob.pe/geoservidor/Carnegie.aspx

example, benefit-sharing mechanisms and addressing land-tenure disparities, because many local communities lack title and tenure rights), and institutional arrangements.

Communications

- *The release of the FCI investor survey highlighted parameters of a successful REDD+ mechanism at a critical time* – The focus of the communications project centered on the release of the investor survey and launch of the FCI at the climate talks in Bangkok, Thailand. Comprehensive media coverage of the investor survey positioned WWF as a reliable source on messages around REDD+ financing and the parameters that would give investors confidence. Upon reflection, staff noted that more could have been done to complement country activities and thus streamline efforts.
- *An integrated plan for communications at the outset of projects is critical* – The quick start of *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+* projects and the inability of leads to ground the approaches and projects in an overall plan have since inspired more cohesive planning for future projects under *REDD+ for People and Nature*. In order to avoid redundant activities or working at cross-purposes, an enabling team must be built and support activities identified at the outset. Examples of support activities includes acting as a connector (including for south-south exchanges), providing more services to the other projects such as fact sheets, media kits and background materials tailored to local circumstances.
- *More effort will be put into pulling stories from the project- and national-level and amplifying them at the international level* – Many country and regional offices expressed great interest in this.
- *Build in better tools to gauge how effective communications efforts are and find ways to measure the impacts of communications work* – Quantifying the impacts of communications efforts is not easy, and more rigor will be made in this area in *REDD+ for People and Nature.*

3c. Integration of lessons learned into future WWF efforts

One of the most potent assets of the FCI is its ability to span WWF geographies and thematic areas to nurture lessons learning between regions and disciplines. The lessons learned during *Engaging Civil Society in REDD+* has directly informed the strategic goals and objectives of the *REDD+ for People and Nature* programme as well as the FCI Strategic Plan for 2010-2013. Over the next three years, the FCI will broaden its learning system in order to maximize the deployment of knowledge and active learning, develop intellectual and practical capacity on REDD+, and apply lessons learning as a means to influence future decisions and actions.

4. Case Studies

International Finance

Objectives:	• Influence the understanding of the role and sequencing of public and private markets funding in the run-up to COP 15 based on detailed WWF policy proposals. Maintain active WWF engagement in key international REDD+ discussions.
Achievements:	• The project commissioned and produced three international reports: on the state of international REDD+ negotiations, on REDD+ funds available outside the UNFCCC framework, and on funding for REDD+ in the US climate change legislation; and four reports focused on national level institutional arrangements for REDD+ in Colombia, Guyana, Indonesia and Peru. • Pablo Gutman, WWF's Director of Environmental Economics and the FCI's International Finance Lead, was invited to contribute to the seminal *REDD+ Institutional Options Assessment* report, commissioned by Norway and compiled by the Meridian Institute, on REDD+ architecture and institutional design, which was presented at all UNFCCC venues, including Bangkok (September 2009), Barcelona (November 2009) and Copenhagen (December 2009).
Challenges & Opportunities:	• In August 2009, just as WWF received its funding from the government of Norway, the Informal Working Group on Interim Financing for REDD+ (IWG-IFR) completed its report on the role and sequencing of public, private and market funding for REDD+. The report's contents had been identified as an output of this WWF project. • The international finance programme retooled its work plan after the publication of the IWG-IFR report. The updated plan called for thorough review of REDD+-related developments in key countries as a way to complement the IWG-IFR report. In the absence of a final COP 15 treaty, these reports proved to be of greater value than expected at COP 15 and provide roadmaps for the maturation of REDD+ activities within these key countries to be pursued over the coming years.
Lessons Learned:	• Adaptive management is serving WWF well in identifying strategic value in its international financing work moving forward. In the absence of a COP 15 treaty, staff agree that, in the interim, national bi-lateral and country-to-country arrangements will take precedence over international-level efforts as nations continue ripening MRV, developing pilot projects and capacity to ultimately fit into a larger international framework. Thus, the country reports, which identify national strategies and how to link national REDD+ institutions to the international REDD+ architecture, offers a clearer sense of the demands over the coming years and identifies a programme of work through concrete examples. • The initial activities identified were all effective: (a) engaging in the international REDD+ discussion in the run-up to COP 15; (b) producing or participating in the production of technical reviews, reports and proposals; (c) advising WWF network on these issues; and (d) collaborating with WWF country offices in the review of country-level arrangements for REDD+.

Communications Strategy

Objectives:	• Convey to key audiences the need to include REDD+ in national and international efforts to address climate change, with a particular focus on the inclusion of REDD+ in the Copenhagen climate treaty negotiations. • Complement the direct engagement by the WWF policy team and country-leads in their interface with negotiators via a) media briefings with key influential media outlets; b) provision of backgrounders, policy briefs and fact-sheets on REDD+, a list of key spokespersons and information on the WWF online pressroom; c) media events such as launch of 2009 Forest Carbon Investor Survey and UNFCCC Bangkok side-event panel discussion; and d) targeted media outreach.
Achievements:	• Successful media briefings on REDD+ and its role in international climate treaty negotiations, with key influential media outlets (e.g. Financial Times, CNN, The Guardian, NBC, AP, The Washington Post). • Release of results of the 2009 Forest Carbon Investor Survey and panel discussion entitled "Roadmap to Implementation: Views on Ensuring REDD+ Financing" at the UNFCCC climate talks in Bangkok, in September 2009. This resulted in significant media coverage on the enabling conditions for investor confidence in REDD+.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The suite of media materials produced for the Bangkok launch and briefings were picked up and utilized by other WWF programmes to support media outreach on forest carbon. The WWF Global Forest and Trade Network used the materials in outreach during the World Forestry Congress in Argentina, enabling further media education on the FCI without direct FCI staff involvement.
Lessons Learned:	• Bringing a unique voice into a crowded arena provides a certain value. By soliciting the views of the investment community through its survey, the FCI used the findings to underscore WWF's existing policy on REDD+. Yet these recommendations were compelling and "news-worthy" because they came from organizations that weren't among the "usual suspects." This allowed FCI to target diverse media and therefore, extend its reach to broader audiences. • Establishing a communications plan early is critical and should be an integral part of strategic planning for FCI initiatives. The plan should identify the enabling team, identify how to avoid redundancies or working at cross-purposes with other initiatives, and identify barriers to success and build in the strategies to overcome those from the outset. • Looking ahead, the FCI communications team will increase its role as a connector, and provider of services (such as media kits and backgrounders that can be tailored to local circumstances) to the other projects. Furthermore, communications staff in country offices have identified the need for FCI to help them access the international media in order to gain exposure beyond their national media outlets. More widespread exposure would help demonstrate the value of sub-regional and local efforts on REDD+ and amplify the lessons learned from those initiatives.

International Forest Policy

Objectives:	• Consolidate efforts of the international forest and conservation communities to achieve zero net deforestation by 2020 and to support creation of a robust REDD+ mechanism under the UNFCCC. • Achieve this consolidation by integrating REDD+ policy work at the 13th World Forestry Congress in Buenos Aires, Argentina (in October 2009), and by completing an analysis of policy opportunities in support of the integration of the "Zero Net Deforestation Target" as a Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) post 2010 target in collaboration with the CBD secretariat and appropriate lobbying and promotion activities.
Achievements:	• The integration of a 2020 forest target in the Revised Strategic Plan of the CBD, resulting in the first UN convention document articulating a concrete 2020 target related to deforestation and forest degradation.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The project utilized the World Forestry Congress and COP 15 as levers to elevate the objective of Zero Net Deforestation by 2020 to the top of the agenda of almost every relevant organization identified, including the UNFCCC, UNCBD, World Bank, FAO, UNFF and others. Achieving this goal was challenging given these organizations' inability to take positions without a clear mandate or approval from their governing bodies and boards.
Lessons Learned:	• Affecting policy change at the international level requires considerable long-term planning, and minimum lead time required before key UNFCCC COP's is two years. The success of this project was enhanced by work already underway (for one and a half years) in the International Forest Programme. Success at the World Forestry Congress could be attributed to this previous work and to the involvement of 45 WWF staff (funded through other sources and most staff not part of the FCI). • Solid initial project design and creating a common understanding of goals between programmes at the outset are critical. The truncated project end date was responsible for the inability to do these things, and resulted in a lack of integration of this project into the FCI (it functioned more as a Forestry Programme project) and the Climate and Energy Network Initiative. • Measuring the success or quantifying how the project deliverables influence decisions at the international policy level was difficult. Good press coverage is one indicator, but is not enough. This project relied on functional relationships with Secretariats and decision-makers as one method for measuring success. Staffs of secretariats indicated via phone calls and e-mail that the FCI message was being heard and integrated into their working environment.

REDD+ in Peru (Capacity building)

Objectives:	• Build national and sub-national capacity for REDD+ in Peru, particularly in the Madre de Dios Amazon region, thereby creating a critical mass of activities for forest conservation and improvement of forest governance, via the following activities: a) a REDD+ capacity building course for regional government officials, indigenous organizations, and civil society in Madre de Dios; b) commission an opportunity cost analysis for the Madre de Dios region to illustrate how REDD+ can offer an economically feasible alternative to other sources of income; and c) participate in and provide technical inputs to the Peruvian government and the national-level REDD+ roundtable to inform the government's position at COP 15 and positively influence development of the national REDD+ strategy.
Achievements:	• 17 key decision makers were successfully trained on REDD+ themes, through the capacity course organized in alliance with the Organization for Tropical Studies-Tropical Andes Alliance (OTS-AAT) and the Peruvian Society of Environmental Law (SPDA). • The draft opportunity cost assessment report demonstrates carbon credits could compete with short term benefits from traditional activities, except for certain areas where the opportunity costs are very high due to mining.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The Peruvian government failed to follow through with its commitment to engage civil society in REDD+. Originally, the REDD+ capacity course was intended to be a partnership with the Ministry of the Environment (MINAM), but recent leadership and staffing changes at MINAM weakened the relationship, and ultimately MINAM did not send a representative to the course. Other partnerships were very effective, such as those with The Peruvian Society of Environmental Law and the Organization for Tropical Studies. • Just before the opportunity cost assessment was completed in mid-December 2009, the WWF Peru Programme Office learned that the Peruvian government would be releasing a similar report for the whole Amazon, at a coarse scale. WWF PPO quickly realized their opportunity cost assessment needed to include data at a finer scale, and thus include data from the Carnegie/WWF CLASlite and light detection and ranging (LiDAR) forest carbon mapping assessment.
Lessons Learned:	• Maintaining access and influence with the federal government is difficult and unreliable. Alternative approaches, such as focusing more effort on regional governments and developing pilots) are useful, but focusing more effort on how international media and the influence of other countries (such as, in this case, regional Latin American countries and those countries demonstrating leadership on REDD+, such as Norway and Indonesia) can help motivate the Peruvian government on REDD+. • Many carbon companies in Madre de Dios are signing forest rights holders into agreements that are not favourable for local communities. WWF PPO has identified this as a major threat to the transparency and success of REDD+.

REDD+ in Indonesia (National Policy Development)

Objectives:	• Support the government of Indonesia in developing plans to implement REDD+, and knit national efforts into international and sub-national interests, relying on WWF policy and forest carbon methodological work. • Contribute to refining methodological development (including establishing baselines, accounting and monitoring forest loss and degradation) and using outcomes from WWF's demonstration activities. • Improve REDD+ governance and incentives and explore improvements through developing inter-sectoral REDD+ policy, credible financial mechanisms, multi-stakeholder institutional arrangements that ensure mechanisms for equitable benefit distribution, targeted capacity building, and involvement of local and indigenous communities.
Achievements	• Indonesian President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono released a policy statement at the G20 in Pittsburgh on September 25, 2009 pledging that Indonesia would reduce its domestic emissions 26% by 2020, compared to business as usual and could reach 41% with international aid. WWF influenced this position via a position paper submitted to the Presidential Office prior to his visit to Pittsburgh and an OpEd in the Jakarta Post on September 15, 2009. • A weekly OpEd column in the Jakarta Post, titled "*Road to Copenhagen*," and wide coverage on REDD+ quoting WWF-Indonesia and WWF affiliates. This includes news coverage and several headlines in Kompas, Antara, the Jakarta Post, Jakarta Globe, Reuters, and others.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• WWF-Indonesia maximized earned media in the lead-up to COP 15. WWF-Indonesia's systematic placement of key messages and positioning as a national resource on climate and REDD+ resulted in consistent coverage in *The Jakarta Post* (which included WWF-Indonesia's weekly "Road to Copenhagen" column), *The Jakarta Globe, Kompas,* and other national/regional media. • WWF-Indonesia developed strong credibility and trust with the national government by supporting the government in the policy-making process, organizing a meeting between the director general of WWF-International and the president of Indonesia, and joining the government delegation at COP 15. This required strong national-level staff, as WWF often acts as an intermediary between the National Council of Climate Change (at the policy level) and the Ministry of Forests (agency that implements most policies). Thus WWF's influence directly affected government positions and negotiation tactics and helped motivate the government to play a leadership role in REDD+.
Lessons Learned:	• Although Indonesia is still in the readiness phase, there remain a number of factors that demonstrate the country's progress toward its REDD+ goals: The government has a national emissions target and a transparent process for involving civil society and indigenous groups; the country drew in external entities (Australia, Norway, the World Bank) to help shape its REDD+ initiatives and pilots; the process for determining baselines and methodologies is transparent and, so far, effective; and government has committed itself to include other sectors in its national carbon accounting system. • REDD+ must involve multiple sectors besides forestry. In Indonesia, palm oil plantations, mining interests, and government infrastructure-development agencies actively complete for access to land so including them in a national carbon accounting system– and instituting commitments, policies, and financial incentives to influence them – is critical for REDD+ success.

REDD+ in Indonesia (Heart of Borneo)

Objectives:	• Stop forest loss and degradation in Indonesia's "Heart of Borneo", an area containing 12 million hectares of forest, in an effort to reduce carbon emissions, safeguard biodiversity values and address poverty reduction through equitable mechanisms for REDD+. • Develop an alternative and additional scenario for REDD+ demonstration activities based on the recognition and inclusion of Community Conservation Areas (CCAs). • Engage communities and local rights-holders in conserving and managing natural assets as part of appropriate reward schemes for REDD+.
Achievements:	• Demonstration of the importance of CCAs in addressing deforestation and forest degradation via documentation and promotion of local consultation. • Bolstering the practice and importance of documentation as a tool to include economic, social and biodiversity values of the forest in planning and decision-making, and as a management tool to support the development of REDD+.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The legal aspects of CCAs, overlapping and conflicting claims of title, lack of inclusion of CCAs in governmental spatial planning and jurisdictional issues associated with CCAs, are currently impeding the development of REDD+ scenarios affecting these areas. The Geowiki may be an effective tool to help mobilize indigenous people and communities around spatial knowledge and the opportunity costs of competing land uses. • In November 2009, the head of the Kutai Barat district threatened to convert 100,000 hectares of community managed forest into oil palm plantations, stalling the assessment that WWF undertook to document economic, social, and biodiversity values of the forest, and shifted efforts to WWF lobbying against the palm oil concession policy. This policy decision reflects the endemic perception that extractive uses of the forest are the most valuable, thus one of the greatest challenges is to demonstrate REDD+ as a viable alternative for income generation.
Lessons Learned:	• It is critical to define the most appropriate point of entry for different audiences to engage in REDD+ discussions. Village governments and communities may not relate to REDD+, carbon markets or carbon as a value in their forest, but they understand forest management and non-timber forest products. Conversely, district governments are most interested in starting the discussion around the income potential from forest carbon and emissions reduction. • Significant effort has been put into understanding the dynamics of the district government and its role in decision-making, the role of communities, and that of palm oil and mining interests, and therefore how WWF can have the greatest impact in regard to this dynamic. • A critical role for WWF-Indonesia staff is to help encourage and broker conversations between communities and the government in order to influence effective REDD+ governance, finance and distribution mechanisms and safeguard the interests of local communities and their livelihoods (and this helps inform the Forest Carbon Partnership Facility Readiness Preparation Proposal process).

Deforestation Drivers (Congo Basin Pilot)

Objectives:	• Develop a prototype open-source collaborative mapping system (the Geowiki) to respond to drivers of deforestation in one of the key regions in the world in terms of habitat and potential forest loss: the Congo Basin. Deforestation drivers include infrastructure development, population growth, agriculture and extractive industries (e.g. logging, mining, oil and gas development). • Once developed, the prototype could be applied to all tropical forest regions of the world, and to many other priority regions. The collaborative mapping system offers a means of engaging civil society and indigenous people to guide planning and decision-making and relies on a consortium of those interested to update and maintain it.
Achievements:	• The Geowiki site is at the advanced development stage, audience testing has begun, a consortium of potential regional partners has formed, and there is strong interest in the Geowiki being applied to other regions (e.g. Peru and Indonesia) with discussions on this underway. • WWF now in advanced discussions with IIASA, an economic modeling research institute, and World Resources Institute (WRI) on developing formal partnerships to collaborate on the Geowiki. • The project received citations in two articles in *Nature News*, which generated a substantial amount of publicity for the Geowiki.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The civil society component has been difficult to implement because at the time there was no designated point person in the WWF Central African Regional Programme Office in Kinshasa. That said, the team identified a suitable technical partner for running the Geowiki in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and a potential pilot site near Virunga National Park. • A key challenge in the Geowiki design was to make it accessible to and easy to use by those who do not have broadband internet access and state-of-the-art computer software systems. The contracted technical company that designed it built in low-tech capabilities so users could contribute data and maps through the Internet or text messaging on a mobile phone.
Lessons Learned:	• A solution to the lack of capacity in the Congo Basin and the challenge of cultivating interest and participation in the Geowiki, has been to work through partners and other international NGOs to grow networks and spread Geowiki use, and to develop web-links with sectoral departments and agencies at the national level. WWF must continue to practice inclusivity to develop and operate the system, while scaling up WWF field capacity in the region. • To facilitate data sharing and legitimize the Geowiki site, a consortium is being developed among civil society organizations, multilateral and bilateral agencies, research institutions, and government departments in the Democratic Republic of the Congo. It is hoped the consortium will be housed in REDD+ National Coordination Committee and will link to regional fora such as COMIFAC. A Geowiki coordinator would facilitate data collection from consortium partners, promote participation in the system and build collaborations with other mapping projects such as the World Resources Institute Forest Transparency Initiative and United Nations Development Programme's Référentiel Géographique Commun (Common Graphic Reference System). The consortium would also help fund the estimated USD $5,000 per year maintenance cost. The consortium approach will be adapted and replicated in other Congo Basin countries.

REDD+ in Guyana (Education and Awareness)

Objectives:	• Provide education and awareness (and in some cases strategies) to civil society leaders and technical staff of key government agencies on concepts related to climate change and REDD+, as well as proposed governmental responses via Guyana's Low Carbon Development Strategy and the World Bank's Forest Carbon Partnership Facility REDD+ readiness plan. Generate input from civil society leaders and technical staff of key government agencies on the government's proposed actions.
Achievements:	• A series of six workshops to disseminate information about REDD+attracted a total of 183 persons, of which more than a hundred are in direct leadership positions, representing 73 communities from four administrative regions of Guyana.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• This project initially intended to focus considerable effort on government agencies. However, over time it was determined those agencies were on track with REDD+ readiness, as demonstrated by the Forestry Commissions' forest carbon stock assessment, into which WWF had input. As a result, this project shifted its focus to providing education and awareness to interior and indigenous communities that would have been neglected. • The Guyana Forestry Commission, which had been involved since the inception of the project, later claimed that it had no knowledge of the project. It attempted to halt the workshops, claiming that their content may not be inline with the government's position. • Reaching out to the interior and indigenous communities delivers information and tools to aid in their assessment of whether they should opt-in to benefit sharing under REDD+. Amerindians have jurisdiction over the forests in their own titled lands (about 14% of the country). Due to consultative considerations, the government has excluded forest lands under Amerindian jurisdiction from its REDD+ plans. Therefore, inclusion of these areas in REDD+ requires that Amerindians opt-in, and will necessitate further negotiations over benefit-sharing mechanisms.
Lessons Learned:	• Reaching indigenous communities requires significant amounts of travel, and special effort has been made to meet with councilors, opinion leaders, and local organization heads. • Communities were very receptive to the materials presented. Work is underway on additional materials, including a radio programme that will air in local languages (the first will be Macusi) and awareness materials that will be translated into local languages. Follow-up with each community will occur to measure progress over time. • It has been challenging finding and engaging technical skills related to REDD+ and climate change within Guyana, as this is such a new area. Those few people working on REDD+ are hard to access for assistance or consulting.

REDD+ Science (Peru)

Objectives:	• To undertake, with the Carnegie Institution for Science, the Peruvian Ministry of Environment (MINAM) and the Amazon Conservation Association, an integrated satellite airborne mapping demonstration project for high resolution carbon stock assessment and monitoring of 4,300,500 hectares of lowland Amazon forest in Madre de Dios, with potential future applicability in all tropical moist forest regions.
Achievements:	• One of the largest high-resolution biomass mapping studies in the world and a new benchmark set for future carbon stock assessments globally. • The procedure used to create the carbon map was presented at COP 15, where it generated great interest among delegates and other forest carbon experts. • As a result of this project, the Madre de Dios regional government, WWF and regional NGOs are collaborating to produce a carbon emissions baseline for the region, based on the CLASlite software.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The project provided estimates of aboveground carbon density at a spatial resolution of 30 meters. This was achieved through use of the CLASLite software package that supports regional forest monitoring for REDD+, and an airborne forest carbon assessment using waveform-light detection and ranging (LiDAR). The results were calibrated through ground measurements with local field-based researchers organized by WWF-Peru. The forest carbon map forms the basis for regional REDD+ readiness activities. • The project had to be compressed into a six-week timeframe, given weather conditions and other complexities that come with working in the Peruvian Amazon. Also, the project goals and outputs had to be adapted to a largely reduced budget, with the result of increased pressure largely falling on the Peruvian field staff.
Lessons Learned:	• The most important lesson was the accuracy and cost-effectiveness of this approach to create a high-resolution carbon map of above ground biomass. The application of CLASlite and LiDAR showed that regional carbon stocks are 32.4% lower than the mean Tier I estimate derived from the IPCC Good Practice Guidelines (2006). The new carbon maps show localized areas of higher carbon stocks in some forests than predicted from global mapping approaches, but there are also widespread reductions in biomass attributable to recent deforestation and degradation that was previously undetected without high resolution satellite and airborne LiDAR techniques. While the IPCC Tier I estimates report an uncertainty of 90% or more and do not resolve the natural and human driven variation in carbon density, this demonstration has an uncertainty of 10% and resolves detailed spatial variation in carbon stocks at high spatial resolution. • Not enough investment was made at the outset of the project to build the necessary relationships and define responsibilities. This resulted in inadequate capacity-building locally, lack of access to the data, and insufficient public recognition. Please refer to page 8 for proposed steps to avoid this in future efforts. • The team ensured that the greatest value was derived from the over flights (half a million hectares flown, with 4,000 hectares done in one hour), by collecting data on Forest Stewardship Council certified forest concessions to complete a side analysis comparing certified and uncertified concessions, and flying over forest biomass research sites. This provides a one-meter resolution resource, allowing people in the region to use the data in a multitude of ways.

REDD+ Science (Tools for Carbon Measurement and Monitoring)

Objectives:	• Develop a field practitioner guidance document for measuring and monitoring forest carbon and disseminate the document throughout WWF programmes and country offices. A toolkit will be produced, identifying best approaches for measuring, mapping and monitoring forest carbon, including well-tested techniques for remote sensing as well as field measurements. Various approaches will be presented and compared, and then technical support and recommendations on best use will be offered. The toolkit will be vetted across selected WWF field offices to get their input on the toolkit's ability to meet their needs, and these reviews will be used to improve and revise the toolkit. The final version will be distributed to WWF field programmes via the web and hardcopies.
Achievements:	• The forest carbon toolkit for field practitioners was completed by Winrock International.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• The international field of forest carbon scientists is in very high demand, there is short supply, and non-profits cannot compete with forest carbon investment firms and other entities with salary bands far exceeding that of the NGO sector. The result was that a forest carbon scientist could not be retained. Rather, Winrock International was retained to complete the toolkit. • By not hiring a forest carbon scientist, the toolkit was delayed, and this unexpectedly allowed for the inclusion of the outcomes of the WWF forest carbon mapping and measuring project (see "REDD+ Science Peru," above) using CLASlite and LiDAR into the toolkit, which is a benefit.
Lessons Learned:	• Adding forest carbon to the technical and capacity building work already underway in the WWF science programme on conservation science, remote sensing and GIS is complementary. • Achieving an MRV programme for a Tier II or III validated carbon project requires significant time; overcoming complexities such as data sharing arrangements, acquiring imagery and working with partners; significant indirect and direct costs; and training staff on the software (which calls for analytical skills, handling remote sensing data and/or GIS). • Once staff are trained, there is a greater threat of them leaving for better paying jobs. Aside from increasing salary (which often is not an option), another way of overcoming this may be to focus training and capacity development on partners and government agencies only.

International Forest Programme Tools

Objectives:	• Analyze how key landscape level conservation planning tools (e.g. High Conservation Value Forest assessment tools, protected area effectiveness tools, land suitability assessments and land-use planning tools) could be adapted or supplemented for use in REDD+ programmes. • Offer recommendations on how to integrate these adapted tools and concepts into the design of REDD+ field-level projects in priority countries, as well as on how management plans and processes can include greater recognition of the role of climate change and adaptation to changing circumstances.
Achievements:	• Managers from 50 National Parks in Indonesia (more than 140 experts) from government institutions and other NGOs were brought together to run a full METT and RAPPAM assessment. Forty experts from government departments, forestry companies and NGOs received training on HCV methodology. The workshops raised significant interest in the region, built capacity among local stakeholders and produced a set of valuable recommendations. • The "Protected Areas and Climate Change" summit, held in November 2009 in Andalusia, Spain for approximately 70 professionals, which produced recommendations and a work plan for future protected area and climate change collaborations. Information related to activities completed under this Norad funded project were delivered to the summit participants.
Challenges & Opportunities:	• One of the most significant opportunities, which solidified partnerships critical to the success of this project, was the *Natural Solutions* report (funded externally, not via Norad) that contains recommendations for governments, protected area managers and NGOs to strengthen the role of protected areas in climate mitigation and adaptation, with a focus on REDD+ linkages. • Work at a regional or field scale is best coordinated by those working in the country as opposed to those farther afield, as the work requires obtaining support from government departments in priority countries and landscapes, in order to proceed with organizing workshops and to effectively integrate concepts into protected area management planning.
Lessons Learned:	• Many conservation tools and platforms are easily adaptable to the forest carbon and REDD+ context. The High Conservation Value Forest assessment tool provides useful complementary information on REDD+ projects, particularly regarding maximizing socio-environmental co-benefits. • As REDD+ activities are carried out in so many countries, having a thematic link between them via an umbrella project such as this one helps to focus programme growth and learning. It also helps assist in maintaining WWF's international role and credibility in landscape level tools for conservation. • Working with government ministries and partners across multiple countries and geographic scales is challenging, and requires scheduling regular conference calls and a mechanism to coordinate activities with the in-country government agency staff.

5. Appendix

List of interviewees:

Lead or staff person	Title	E-mail
Daniel Arancibia	Director, WWF LAC Programme	daniel.arancibia@wwfus.org
Fitrian Ardiansyah	Programme Director, Climate & Energy, WWF Indonesia	fardiansyah@wwf.or.id
Maria Eugenia Arroyo	REDD+ Programme, WWF Peru	me.arroyo@wwfperu.org
Alexander Belokurov	Manager, Landscape Conservation, WWF International	abelokurov@wwfint.org
Leo Bottrill	Infrastructure Program Officer, MPO	leo.bottrill@wwfus.org
Janice Bollers	Forest Officer, WWF Guyana	jbollers@wwf.gy
Paul Chatterton	Acting Leader, WWF FCI	paul.chatterton@wwf.at
Ken Creighton	Principal Advisor, Forests and Climate, WWF AMP and CARPO	ken.creighton.wwf@gmail.com
Chris Elliott	Executive Director, Conservation	celliott@wwfint.org
Pablo Gutman	Director, Environmental Economics	pablo.gutman@wwfus.org
Colby Loucks	Director, Conservation Science, WWF US	colby.loucks@wwfus.org
George Powell	Senior Conservation Scientist, WWF US	george.powell@wwfus.org
Elaine Pura	Program Lead, Engaging Civil Society in REDD+, WWF FCI	elaine.pura@gmail.com
Gerald Steindlegger	Manager, International Forest Programme, WWF International	gerald.steindlegger@wwf.at
Julio Tresierra	Regional Advisor, WWF LAC Programme	jtresierra@wwf.nl
Melissa Tupper	Director, Communications, WWF FCI	melissa.tupper@wwfus.org
Michael Valqui	Director, Amazon Programme, WWF Peru	michael.valqui@wwfperu.org
Zulfira Warta	REDD+ Project Development Coordinator, WWF Indonesia	zwarta@wwf.or.id
Iwan Wibisono	REDD+ Coordinator, WWF Indonesia	iwibisono@wwf.or.id

The mission of WWF is to stop the degradation of the planet's natural environment and to build a future in which humans live in harmony with nature, by

- conserving the world's biological diversity
- ensuring that the use of renewable natural resources is sustainable
- reducing pollution and wasteful consumption

panda.org/forestcarbon

WWF Forest Carbon Initiative
Discussion Paper

E forestcarbon@wwf.panda.org

Published in August 2010 by WWF–World Wide Fund For Nature (Formerly World Wildlife Fund), Gland, Switzerland.

WWF

for a living planet®